

The ARC Centre of Excellence for the  
History of Emotions (Europe 1100-1800) presents:

# VIOLENCE AND EMOTIONS IN EARLY MODERN EUROPE, 1400-1800



Image: David Vinckboons, Boerenverdriet (*Farmer's Sorrow*), after c. 1619. SK-A-1351. © Rijksmuseum.

Date: Wednesday, 2 October 2013  
Times: 8.45am-5.30pm  
Venue: Michael Chaney Case Study Room (G 42),  
Business School, The University of  
Western Australia

Contact: Sarah Finn at [sarah.finn@uwa.edu.au](mailto:sarah.finn@uwa.edu.au)

REGISTRATION FREE BUT PLACES LIMITED  
BOOKINGS ESSENTIAL

In this symposium, we explore the way in which emotions engendered and sustained violence in Europe from 1400 to 1800. We seek to explore the changing relationship of emotional language (textual, visual or material) to the experience, repression or conceptualisation of violence over this period.

**WEDNESDAY 2 OCTOBER 2013**

TIME	SPEAKERS
8.15-8.45	TEA/ COFFEE
8.45 – 9.00	Welcome- SUSAN BROOMHALL
<b>SESSION 1: CRIME AND PUNISHMENT</b>	
Chair: DR JOANNE MCEWAN (Associate Investigator, ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions)	
9.00 – 10.40 (20 minutes per speaker)	<i>Crime and its punishment: emotions in the heart of the city: Renaissance Italy</i> - ELISABETH CROUZET-PAVAN (Université de Paris-Sorbonne) <i>Murder and Misericordia : Reconstructing violent death and emotion in the Roman campagna in the seventeenth century</i> - LISA BEAVEN (La Trobe University) <i>Execution ballads in early modern France</i> - UNA MCILVENNA (ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, The University of Sydney) <i>Violence Contained, Spilt Blood</i> - JON TARRY (The University of Western Australia) DISCUSSION
10.40 – 11.00	MORNING TEA
<b>SESSION 2: DISASTER AND PROVIDENCE</b>	
Chair: DR RAPHAELE GARROD (Postdoctoral Research Fellow, ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions)	
11.00 – 12.15 (20 minutes per speaker)	<i>Violent Nature: Emotions and unusual weather events in sixteenth-century French journals and diaries</i> - SUSAN BROOMHALL (ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, The University of Western Australia) <i>Anguish and its significance in Nostradamus' thought</i> - DENIS CROUZET (Université de Paris-Sorbonne) <i>Violent anger, violent zeal: emotions within the late sixteenth-century providential economy of Johann Jakob Wick (1560-1587)</i> - CHARLES ZIKA (ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, The University of Melbourne) DISCUSSION
12.15 – 1.00	LUNCH
<b>SESSION 3: WOMEN, THE RELIGIOUS, AND SUPERNATURAL</b>	
Chair: PROFESSOR JACQUELINE VAN GENT (Senior Research Fellow, ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions)	
1.00 – 2.15 (20 minutes per speaker)	<i>"Big belly, big mouth, fat pig!": Tantrums and tumults in the sixteenth-century Hôtel-Dieu de Paris</i> - LISA ELLIOTT (The University of Western Australia) <i>Devotional violence and the emotional economy in early modern French religious life</i> - SARAH FERBER (University of Wollongong) <i>Harming or Healing: Witchcraft, Violence, and Emotions in Early Modern England</i> - JUDITH BONZOL (The University of Sydney) DISCUSSION
2.15 – 2.20	SHORT BREAK AND COFFEE REFILL
<b>SESSION 4: PRINT, PROPAGANDA, HISTORIES</b>	
Chair: WINTHROP PROFESSOR BOB WHITE (Program Leader, ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions)	
2.20 – 4.00 (20 minutes per speaker)	<i>Building an early reflexion on the French Wars of Religion: violence and emotions in the early historical works about the Civil Wars</i> - STEFANIA GARGIONI (University of Kent) <i>Propaganda in the English Civil War: Designing emotions to divide a nation</i> - TROY HEFFERNAN (University of Southern Queensland) <i>The Shifting Boundaries of Tolerance in John Lockman's "Book of Martyrs" (1760)</i> - GIOVANNI TARANTINO (ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, The University of Melbourne) <i>Massacre and its Affects, 1700-1800</i> - PHILIP DWYER (University of Newcastle) DISCUSSION
4.00 – 4.15	AFTERNOON TEA
<b>SESSION 5: ENLIGHTENMENT?</b>	
Chair: DR KATRINA O'LOUGHLIN (Postdoctoral Research Fellow, ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions)	
4.15 – 5.10 (20 minutes per speaker)	<i>Violence in Medicine in the Early Modern Period</i> - BOB WESTON (The University of Western Australia) <i>Honour, Shame and Violence in a Colonial Society</i> - PENNY RUSSELL (The University of Sydney) DISCUSSION
5.10 – 5.30	<b>SYMPOSIUM DISCUSSION AND CLOSE</b>
6.30 – 7.00	Pre-dinner drinks at the University Club Bar
7.00	<b>SYMPOSIUM DINNER AT THE UNIVERSITY CLUB RESTAURANT</b>



## Abstracts



LISA BEAVEN

(La Trobe University)

### **Murder and *Misericordia*: Reconstructing violent death and emotion in the Roman campagna in the seventeenth century**

This paper compares the emotional dialogues in two different data sets recording violence in the Roman Campagna in the seventeenth century. One is the Editti e Bandi, the official edicts issued by the papal and civic authorities of Rome, and the other the Libro dei Morti, the list of the unburied bodies collected from the countryside by the confraternity of S. Maria dell'Orazione e Morte. While the official edicts link emotion and morality and concentrate on strategies to solve individual crimes and catch and punish the perpetrators, the Libro dei Morti is a far more personal account of the aftermath of this violence. The confraternity operated as an affective cluster which shared a mission to collect and bury the dead. Members went to great lengths to identify the victims they collected and rather than being focussed on retribution, concentrated on the need to recognise each individual and commemorate their death. The emotion in the handwritten entries of the confraternity is one centred on *misericordia*, a combination of grief and compassion for those who had suffered so brutally at the hands of others. In their precise documentation of the circumstances of finding each body however, we can glimpse beyond their response the traces of emotions in the acts of violence they record.

JUDITH BONZOL

(The University of Sydney)

### **Harming or Healing: Witchcraft, Violence, and Emotions in Early Modern England**

In 1604 a cunning woman from Dorset was violently assaulted by members of a local gentry family. In her plea to Star Chamber, Joane Guppie claimed her assailants with some "great overgrown brambles did rente and teare the flesh from her face", saying "they came for her bludd, and would have it before they departed". In their defence the perpetrators said it was "a comonly revealed opinion in the country" that to "fetche bloud" from the person that had caused the illness would "cure them that be hurt". Scratching a witch and obtaining her blood was adopted as an efficacious method by sick and debilitated people, and their families, to find some relief from their afflictions. But the desire for punishment and revenge, driven by guilt, fear, and anger, was clearly driving many of these violent attacks against witches. Instances of witch scratching was frequently recorded and commented on in court records, witchcraft pamphlets, and scholarly treatises; legal, scientific, and theological discussion examined the efficacy and morals of the practice. This paper explores the emotional complexity of the practice of witch scratching in early modern England.

## SUSAN BROOMHALL

*(ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, The University of Western Australia)*

### **Violent Nature: Emotions and unusual weather events in sixteenth-century French journals and diaries**

This paper focusses on a study of some 23 journal accounts from across sixteenth-century France, analysing their recording of violent weather events. For the majority, weather was diarised when it was perceived to be unusual in its form, extent, or in the damage it wrought. By reading accounts of disordered occurrences in relation to other diarised content, the relationship between these events and others (political, local, religious and social) can be discerned. This paper investigates the emotions articulated about disastrous and violent weather events over the century, and their attribution to the phenomena itself, to God or to the people who experienced it. These reveal particular modes of thinking and expression about disaster, interpretations that appear to be shaped by locale, profession, gender, education, faith, and time period. I will also try to distinguish the capacities of journal- and *mémoire*-type texts respectively to draw upon print literature and to articulate emotions regarding such meteorological violence.

## DENIS CROUZET

*(Université de Paris-Sorbonne)*

### **Anguish and its significance in Nostradamus' thought**

Nostradamus' prophetic writing seems to have an aim: to create a feeling of fear, via the murders, the massacres, the plagues, the natural disasters which are to come, all announcing God's wrath and revealing a "guilty" humanity, full of sins. However, Nostradamus' aim, via the aid of "emotion", is more complex than the apparent logic of terror: he aims to generate, inside each reader, the feeling of humane nothingness and as a consequence, to generate in each of them, a conversion to a God, embodying hope. What this paper seeks to demonstrate is that an emotion should never be understood as "one", because it always aims to produce its contrary, and in Nostradamus' thought, it is to guide from anguish to serenity.

## ELISABETH CROUZET-PAVAN

*(Université de Paris-Sorbonne)*

### **Crime and its punishment: emotions in the heart of the city : Renaissance Italy**

At a time when, in study after study, historians of Italian cities regularly reveal the diversity, in such communities, of ways of conflict resolution, it might appear odd to direct our attention to punitive justice. Some years ago, analyses of the repressive judicial system and its successive developments serving a more authoritarian organisation of power were the subject of numerous works on Florence and Venice. While the inquisitorial proceedings, tightening of social control, and the progress of, if not the State, then at least a more coercive political power, were being widely discussed, it was logical to extend that interest to the staging of punitive ceremonies.

Thus began the descriptions of tortured, dismembered bodies, exhibited at the city gates. Thus also came, in the quest to restore the *éclat* of torture and the character of the administration of punishment, references to gallows, stocks and gibbets erected around the city. Most importantly, information surfaced on public ceremonies and the messages they carried from powers having

conceived a new ideology of justice based on social pacification. These numerous works bore fruit and thus we went from the purposely teleological initial studies, which read in the torment of the bodies and sophistication of the executions the sole progress of the State, to more nuanced interpretations.

The question thus arises: why return to this subject? We may observe the very often perfunctory, even repetitious and conventional remarks reserved for the places where punishment was administered. The initial goal here is therefore to expand the earlier analyses, limited to the merely repressive aspects of the judicial process, by showing the complexity and mobility of the spatial scenarios employed, with two aims: to stop treating the urban space like a platform upon which the public authorities would mark their presence, and to understand how with those punitive ceremonies the aim was not only to trigger horror or fear. In a second series of observations, the Venetian example will highlight how punishment could also be administered in everyday locations of life and crime, which will help us to understand how complex the range of emotions involved in those punitive scenarios was. This will be followed by a conclusion discussing the range of uses for spaces in order to better understand the diverse territorialities which managed to coexist in an Italian city of the early Renaissance and the social and political uses that were made of it.

## PHILIP DWYER

*(The University of Newcastle)*

### **Massacre and its Affects, 1700-1800**

Massacres have been a constant throughout history, but prior to the seventeenth century, perpetrators and witnesses to mass killings left behind accounts that were determinedly descriptive, and devoid of any sentiment or emotion. Using what have been termed "war memoirs", accounts left by veterans of various European wars, this paper discusses how readers were meant to interpret these sometimes graphic accounts, and discusses the advent of a culture of sensibility towards the second half of the eighteenth century. That new culture allowed for a different interpretation of the consequence and aftermaths of extreme violence.

## LISA ELLIOTT

*(The University of Western Australia)*

### **"Big belly, big mouth, fat pig!": Tantrums and tumults in the sixteenth-century Hôtel-Dieu de Paris**

On 2 May 1505 the traditional governors of the Paris Hôtel-Dieu, the Chapter of Paris, relinquished their temporal governance of the hospital to the Parlement of Paris after two decades of confrontation between themselves and the hospital's religious staff, particularly the nuns. Attempts to reform the hospital had resulted in one lay governor being hounded to his death by the verbal abuse hurled at him by the religious staff and another finding his position untenable as the religious staff refused to acknowledge his authority over them. These confrontations, which could sometimes turn violent, did not end with the installation of eight secular governing men, but marked the beginning of fresh outbreaks of verbal and physical violence in the hospital as the new governors sought to reform the Hôtel-Dieu from a refuge for all to a hospital focussed on the spiritual and physical care of the sick poor (*pauvres malades*). Extant documentation on the tumults within the hospital following 1505 demonstrates the emotional connection the nuns in particular had with the hospital, which was their home as well as their work place. When the governors brought in Flemish nuns to



Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres, *Aretino in the Studio of Tintoretto*, 1848.  
© The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

assist them in implementing reforms, they suffered verbal and physical abuse from their Parisian counterparts resulting in one nun being returned to her parents, having been driven mad by the tumults and others fleeing back to their convents. The documented verbal abuse of each other, the governors and the male religious staff creates an impression of a hospital in which emotions ran high, as their traditional relationship with the hospital was altered around them. The verbal abuse would, on occasion, evolve into physical violence. One nun, in a fit of madness, murdered her cell mate, attempted to kill another before flinging herself from a window into the Seine. This paper will examine the reported instances of verbal and physical violence within the sixteenth-century Paris Hôtel-Dieu, analysing the motivations behind the frequent tumults and tantrums within the hospital and how the violence manifested itself.

## SARAH FERBER

*(The University of Wollongong)*

### **Devotional violence and the emotional economy in early modern French religious life**

In the early modern era of Catholic reform the practice of self-mortification was governed by an emotional vocabulary related to the seven deadly sins, and more precisely, the sin of pride. In an environment such as the cloister which required

uniformity and regulation, too great an emphasis in a person's devotional practice on the imagined holiness attained through self-mortification could open them to a charge of pride. A group emphasis on self-mortification could also contribute to a breakdown of discipline in other aspects of enclosed life. The history of self-mortification can therefore be understood as a significant component of the problematic forms of religiosity which required "the discernment of spirits", that is, judgment as to whether events in the physical world were manifestations of divine rather than diabolical influence. This paper will consider several cases in which self-mortification became a contested site for establishing the holiness of women in seventeenth-century France.

## STEFANIA GARGIONI

*(The University of Kent)*

### **Building an early reflexion on the French Wars of Religion: violence and emotions in the early historical works about the Civil Wars.**

My paper focusses on the relationship between emotions and violence in the early historical works on the French Wars of Religion (late sixteenth – early seventeenth century). Drawing on a corpus of texts, both Catholic and Protestant works that aim to create an early historical reflexion on the Civil Wars, I will analyse the role of the emotions in the narratives about violence. Firstly, I will investigate the links between violence and emotions in the texts produced during the French Wars of Religion, which were sources for the historical texts belonging to the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century. Secondly, I will focus on how both Catholic and Huguenot historical texts presented the violence: the emplotting, the use of emotions and the rhetorical devices. Finally, I will discuss the importance of emotions in the construct of an early historical reflexion on the French Wars of Religion. Particularly, I will summarise the different use of emotions operated by the different political groups. If the Protestants were focussed more on negative emotions, the Catholics were concerned with positive emotions, related to the unity of the French kingdom. In both cases, the relationship between emotions and violence was significant to building both a memory and an historical *doxa* about the French Civil Wars.

## TROY HEFFERNAN

*(The University of Southern Queensland)*

### **Propaganda in the English Civil War: Designing emotions to divide a nation**

David Como said the English Civil War was fought as much through the printing press as it

was the battlefield. At a time when popular politics was burgeoning, the people who designed the propaganda knew intricate details of the Civil War, and they carefully manipulated the information to manufacture the desired emotions of those whose support they needed. The primary emotion they attempted to cultivate was fear. Propaganda had always relied on the power of fear as it was one of the great motivators. The professional propaganda writers of the 1640s knew that fear could be used as a device that would enlighten the reader to the propagandist's point of view, encourage outrage, create a sense of purpose, allegiance, and ultimately to persuade people to fight for the cause. The power of fear and the other motivations that could be procured from it led to a time of virtually no censorship. This allowed the posters and pamphlets to depict beheadings, massacres, and other wartime atrocities for the sole purpose of instilling fear in the reader. As Parliament fought the King, the propaganda produced had to justify the bloodshed and encourage the populace to select the desired side. This led to propaganda taking the very worst, and often isolated, events and portraying them in a way that suggested that anyone in England was susceptible to that level of violence from the opposition. This was how propagandists designed the emotion of fear and knew that its later effects would create vulnerability, anger, camaraderie, allegiance, and the desire to fight the opposition.

## UNA MCILVENNA

*(ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions,  
The University of Sydney)*

### Execution ballads in early modern France

Across early modern Europe the news of crime and punishment was broadcast via the medium of song. This paper explores French execution ballads, or *complaintes* as they were known, from the sixteenth century through the nineteenth century. It examines how violence – both the violence committed by the criminal and upon the body of the criminal – is depicted in these songs. Looking at stylistic features in the *complaintes*, such as the vocabulary, choice of tune and visual presentation, it asks how these features worked together to encourage the audience to respond emotionally to the often brutal destruction of the condemned's body. Attention is given to how *complaintes* changed over time, particularly after the introduction of the guillotine, and to how French traditions compared with those of other countries. Exploring (and singing) the songs about the famous executions of Louis XVI, Damiens, and Mandrin, as well as the executions of less well-known folk, I demonstrate how song and performance were integral to the everyday spectacle of violence in early modern France.

## PENNY RUSSELL

*(The University of Sydney)*

### Honour, Shame and Violence in a Colonial Society

The significance of emotion in the shaping of colonial masculinities is often overlooked. This paper explores the lingering effects of eighteenth-century European honour codes in the early decades of white settlement in New South Wales. It argues that in both defences and critiques of acts of interpersonal violence, the traditional association of honour with status and hierarchy became entangled with a newer language of personal integrity and moral sensibility. The emotional style of individuals, as much as their social standing in the community, was apparent in the narratives or emotive terms they employed to justify or condemn violence.

## GIOVANNI TARANTINO

*(ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions,  
The University of Melbourne)*

### The Shifting Boundaries of Tolerance in John Lockman's "Book of Martyrs" (1760)

Presented in a question and answer form, the *History of the Cruel Sufferings of the Protestants, and Others, by Popish Persecutions*, by Hogarth's friend John Lockman, was mainly designed for use in schools and as a conversational topic when Protestant families gathered in the evenings. Written at the time of the last Jacobite uprising but published only in 1760 in the aftermath of the English conquest of Quebec, Lockman's *History* was an attempt to contrast, not without contradictions, his highly emotional accounts of Catholic endeavours to establish their religion by "the most barbarous practices" with a "Protestant" approach to colonisation: "A reflexion on the temporal advantages that might accrue, to these kingdoms, from our possessing so widely extended a country as Canada, must rejoice the heart of every true Englishman. But to consider this only in a religious view ... what happiness would accrue to millions, yet unborn, should you carry the pure light of the gospel, into far distant regions, now either clouded by Paganism; or, what may be still worse, infected with Romish principles: principles teeming with cruelty".

## JON TARRY

*(The University of Western Australia)*

### Violence Contained, Spilt Blood

The artist Caravaggio, a violent lawbreaker, smashed the rules of representation through a painting, which earned him a knighthood from the order of St John Valletta. Ultimately the knighthood was revoked, and it took place in front of the painting that earned Caravaggio the status. The image depicts the execution of John the Baptist, while nearby Salome stands with a golden platter to receive his head. Another woman, who has been identified as Herodias or simply as a bystander, who realises that the execution is wrong, stands by in shock while a jailer issues instructions and the executioner draws his dagger to finish the beheading. It is the only work by Caravaggio to bear the artist's signature, which is gouged in red blood spilling from the Baptist's cut throat. The depiction of violence is carefully considered, as figures appear acutely calm, saturated in the light-bathed setting, which serves to amplify the emotive dimension of the work. Emotion is expressed through the stillness of the figures' organisation. The left forearm of the executioner is vertically poised emphasising the axis of the picture.

## ROBERT WESTON

*(The University of Western Australia)*

### Violence in medicine in the early modern period

In the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries medicine utilised treatments which were considered by some contemporaries to be acts of violence. This paper examines the emotions such activities evoked. One particular example considered in this paper is the process of inoculation as a preventative measure against smallpox, an activity which invoked emotions of anxiety, fear, even anger, amongst medical practitioners and their patients. Such resort to violence against the person appeared contemporarily to some as



being at odds with physicians' commitments to curing the sick. There is a wealth of correspondence, newspaper articles and medical treatises which expose the extent to which these feelings were articulated. How were these emotions expressed, negotiated, and perhaps overcome? What persuasive techniques did physicians use to allay the fears of their patients, or their fellow practitioners? Inoculation was not the only practice that medical practitioners supported or employed which were of a violent nature. The manner in which the insane were treated, and some of the medications which physicians prescribed more generally, can be described as falling in the same category. Whilst this paper is focussed on the latter part of the early modern period, these issues are echoed today, and can be compared with, for example, some of the claims made against current vaccination programmes.

## CHARLES ZIKA

*(ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions,  
The University of Melbourne)*

### **Violent anger, violent zeal: emotions within the late sixteenth-century providential economy of Johann Jakob Wick (1560-1587)**

The vast archive of human and divine action put together by the Zurich pastor Johann Jakob Wick over almost three decades in the later sixteenth century provides us with an array of material in which to consider the role of emotions in the mental and religious economy of the period. While some violent and destructive events within the natural or human sphere are described as having no clearly discernible meaning, others are considered exemplary in their supernatural or providential significance and become linked to divine reaction or intention. Many natural or meteorological events are read as signs of God's growing impatience, the boiling over of his anger, the registering of his disgust, as well as expressions of his zeal for justice or mercy.

This paper will concentrate on readings of the terrible violence perpetrated by individuals against other members of their society, and how recourse to the emotional registers surrounding such events as murder, rape and dismemberment play a critical role in re-locating them in a framework of providential action and divine meaning. It will attempt to explore how the transformation of the meaning of human violence in such cases often leads to the divine response becoming a model and stimulus for human response, on the part of communities and their godly representatives, the magistrates. And thirdly, it will examine how the representation of these events in their re-telling, re-reading, and re-viewing exploits emotional triggers connected to individual and social memory to re-live the lessons of what might otherwise be considered events distant in time or space.



*Sculpture Italian (Florence), Two Men Fighting a Lion, 17th–18th century(?).  
© The Metropolitan Museum of Art, The Friedsam Collection, Bequest of  
Michael Friedsam, 1931.*

# EMOTIONS MAKE HISTORY

THE ARC CENTRE OF EXCELLENCE  
FOR THE HISTORY OF EMOTIONS  
(EUROPE 1100-1800)

The University of Western Australia  
M201, 35 Stirling Highway  
CRAWLEY  
6009

T: +61 8 6488 3858  
E: [emotions.uwa.edu.au](mailto:emotions.uwa.edu.au)  
W: [www.historyofemotions.org.au](http://www.historyofemotions.org.au)  
Twitter: @ThinkEmotions



THE UNIVERSITY OF  
WESTERN AUSTRALIA  
*Achieve International Excellence*



Australian Government  
Australian Research Council



AUSTRALIAN RESEARCH COUNCIL CENTRE OF EXCELLENCE FOR THE  
HISTORY OF EMOTIONS