



**SEMINAR SERIES**  
Entangled Histories of  
Emotions in the  
Mediterranean World



**L-Università ta' Malta**  
Mediterranean Institute



SOCIETY FOR THE  
**HISTORY OF  
EMOTIONS**

# Moral Sentiments in the Mediterranean: Social, Historical and Cultural Perspectives



**DATE:** Monday 11 February 2019

**TIME:** 9am–5pm

**VENUE:** The University of Malta

**CONVENORS:**

Jean-Paul Baldacchino (University of  
Malta) and Giovanni Tarantino  
(University of Florence)

**RSVP: FREE EVENT. RSVP to**  
[isabelle.abela@um.edu.mt](mailto:isabelle.abela@um.edu.mt)  
**by 11 January 2019 for**  
**catering purposes.**

Image: Jacques-Louis David, *The Anger of Achilles*, 1819, Oil on canvas, 41 7/16 x 57 1/16 in. (105.3 x 145 cm), Framed: 52 1/4 x 68 x 4 in. (132.7 x 172.7 x 10.2 cm), AP 1980.07 Courtesy of Kimbell, Art Museum, Fort Worth, Texas.

This workshop will look specifically at the relationship between emotions and moral structures in the Mediterranean region. It starts from the premise that 'emotions may actually be essential and enduring features of our moral character' (Oatley 1999: 5). The workshop will integrate two different perspectives. It will look at the role that emotions have played in the construction of 'moral reason' in the Mediterranean. What is the relationship between morality, emotions and rationality in the different societies of the region? When are sentiments valid grounds for moral action? The workshop will also look at specific emotions whose proper object could be identified as 'moral' (pride, shame, guilt, compassion and humility, for example). Are there regional similarities in the ways in which such emotions are understood

and the actions they impel? Do the the local semantic inflections of such moral sentiments underscore a different understanding of morality and/or the emotions? Were there significant historical shifts in the ways in which such emotions are articulated within the economic, political and social currents in the region? How are moral sentiments engendered in the Mediterranean? Recognising that such emotions, if not socially constructed are at least socially articulated, contributors to this workshop will look at varieties of moral sentiments in the Mediterranean and its narratives. Contributors can focus on individual emotions (past and present), look at the deployment of emotions or conduct a comparative study of one or more emotions within a society or across different societies across the Mediterranean basin.



# Moral Sentiments in the Mediterranean: Social, Historical and Cultural Perspectives

Monday 11 February 2018, Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta

Convenors: Jean Paul Baldacchino (University of Malta); Giovanni Tarantino (University of Florence)

<b>PROGRAM</b>	
<b>9.00</b>	<b>Registration</b>
<b>9.15–9.30</b>	<b>Opening Remarks</b>
<b>9.30–11.00</b>	<b>Session 1: <u>The Moral and the Political in Turkey</u></b> <b>Moderator:</b> Prof. Nadia Al-Bagdadi, Central European University
	<b>‘Learning to Perceive the City: Activism as Ethical and Sentimental Education in Istanbul’</b> Prof. Christopher Houston, Department of Anthropology, Macquarie University
	<b>‘Melancholy is a City: The Moral Refuge of Orhan Pamuk’s Istanbul’</b> Dr Norbert Bugeja, Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta
	<b>‘Modifying the Moral Self Through Sufi Music Pedagogy in Turkey’</b> Dr Banu Senay, Department of Anthropology, Macquarie University
	<b>Discussion</b>
<b>11.00–11.30</b>	<b>Coffee Break</b>
<b>11.30–13.00</b>	<b>Session 2: <u>At the Borders of Morality: Anthropological Perspectives on Morality and Sentiments in the Mediterranean</u></b> <b>Moderator:</b> Prof. John Chircop, Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta
	<b>‘Amoral Sentiments in the Mediterranean: Familism, Civility and Pride’</b> Prof. Jon P. Mitchell, Department of Anthropology, University of Sussex
	<b>‘Is Honour a Moral Sentiment? Re-interpreting the Honour-Shame Syndrome in the Mediterranean’</b> Dr Jean Paul Baldacchino, Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta
	<b>‘Narrating the Humanitarian Border: Moral Deliberations of Territorial Border Workers on the EU’s Mediterranean Border’</b> Dr Daniela DeBono, Malmö University
	<b>Discussion</b>
<b>13.00–14.30</b>	<b>Lunch Break</b>
<b>14.30–14.40</b>	<b>‘The “Mediterranean Basin” System of Human Movement: How to Design and Develop a Form of Mathematical Modelling which Captures its Mid- and Long-Term Behaviour’</b> Prof. Graziano Gentili, INdAM Rome
<b>14.40–16.30</b>	<b>Roundtable</b> <b>‘Entangled Sentiments: Feeling for a Global History of Emotions from Within Different Disciplines’</b> <b>Moderator:</b> Dr Katrina O’Loughlin, Brunel University <b>Participants:</b> Lisa Beaven (La Trobe University), Nadia al-Bagdadi (Central European University), Luisa Simonutti (CNR-ISPF Milan), Mirko Sardelić (Croatian Academy of Sciences and Arts), Giovanni Tarantino (University of Florence), Ann Thomson (European University Institute)
<b>16.30–16.45</b>	<b>Concluding Remarks</b>

# ABSTRACTS AND BIOS

## **Learning to Perceive the City: Activism as Ethical and Sentimental Education in Istanbul**

**Christopher Houston, Macquarie University**

Between 1975 and the military coup in 1980 Istanbul was a city of activists. Leftist groups' educating of militants involved cultivating a sense or sensibility that would enable them to notice and decry particular aspects of the environment – poverty, injustice, and inequality – or be moved to action by certain dimensions of people's lives. Activist organisations were communities of practice, transforming militants' ethical perceptions. In this paper I explore activist enacting of these ethical sensibilities in the *gecekondu*, the massive ring of shantytowns that surrounded the city and served as a vast pool of cheap labour for its factories and industrial workshops. Militant groups perceived the shantytown as a site of revolutionary potential. But did their service, consciousness-raising and attempts both to fit in with, mobilise and change local inhabitants meet with residents' support and approval?

**Christopher Houston** is Associate Professor of Anthropology at Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia. He has carried out extensive fieldwork in Turkey on Islamic social movements, nationalism and urban anthropology, including most recently on political activism in Istanbul in the years immediately before and after the 1980 military coup. He is author of *Islam, Kurds and the Turkish Nation State* (Berg Publishers, 2002), and *Kurdistan: Crafting of National Selves* (Indiana University Press, 2008); and co-editor of *Phenomenology in Anthropology: A Sense of Perspective* (Indiana University Press, 2015). He has published his work in a number of journals including *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*; *Die Welt des Islams*; *Political Geography*; *Theory, Culture and Society*; *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* and *Critique of Anthropology*. He was President of the Australian Anthropological Society in 2014 and 2015.

## **Melancholy is a City: The Moral Refuge of Orhan Pamuk's Istanbul**

**Norbert Bugeja, University of Malta**

Istanbul-born novelist Orhan Pamuk has often made observations about his own 'fate' as a writer whose itinerary – unlike those of writers like Vladimir Nabokov or Joseph Conrad which were inflected by exile and displacement – is firmly informed by Istanbul, the city of his birth. This paper will argue that Pamuk's writing, and especially his apparent 'Istanbul trilogy' – the novel *The Black Book*, the memoir *Istanbul*, and the novel *The Museum of Innocence* – deploys a specific understanding of melancholic affect that seeks to diversify his native spaces in order to derive from them insights, at once political and affectional, into the post-imperial and early Cold-War metropolis. In this body of literary work, the melancholy key that Pamuk terms *hüzün* expands into a capacious critical index in its own right. *Hüzün* becomes a grammar through which Pamuk laments the demise of the city's multi-ethnic conviviality under Ottoman rule, and takes a stand against the persecution of the city's non-Muslim religious and ethnic communities leading up to and following the establishment of the Turkish Republic. Most importantly, it is a critique of the moral degeneracy of Kemalism as a societal and political normativity that has undermined its own promises in the process of carving out an identitarian form of national self-understanding. *Hüzün* is an affective dimension endowed with spatial characteristics: a sentiment that may at once absorb the city's peripheralisation and historic loss, and open the latter up as a mode of moral agency. It becomes a 'poetic licence', as Pamuk would have it, to 'feel paralysed' in the face of the systematic implementation of political amnesia by various discourses of power over a century that has changed the ex-imperial metropole's standing in the world.

**Norbert Bugeja** is Senior Lecturer in Postcolonial Studies at the Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta. He has lectured at the universities of Warwick (UK), Kent (UK) and Malta. His published research in Postcolonial and Mediterranean Studies includes the volume *Postcolonial Memoir in the Middle East* (Routledge, 2012) as well as book chapters, guest-edited journal special issues and peer-reviewed articles. He is General Editor of the *Journal of Mediterranean Studies*.

## **Modifying the Moral Self Through Sufi Music Pedagogy in Turkey**

**Dr Banu Senay, Macquarie University**

This paper explores the pedagogy of an important and highly popular Islamic musical practice in the city of Istanbul, the tradition of ney playing (the reed flute). Intimately connected with Sufism in both the Ottoman Empire and, for better or worse, in modern secular Turkey, the ney has been a key instrument in both Ottoman and post-Ottoman art music. In this talk I examine the transformative power of this art practice to cultivate in learners not only new artistic but also ethical perceptions. I frame the transformative faculty of this musical enterprise 'ethical modification' to avoid over-privileging the efficacy of the skilled practice for fashioning radically different moral selves. Inspired by emerging debates in the anthropology of ethics, I outline the ways in which the ney is taught both through a technical focus on music and through the Islamic pedagogical practice of *sohbet* (companionship-in-conversation), proposing how they combine together to cultivate certain affective-ethical dispositions in players' moral selves.

**Dr Banu Senay** is a Lecturer in the Department of Anthropology at Macquarie University, Sydney. She has extensive research expertise in the areas of migration, transnationalism and diasporic politics, and is the author of *Beyond Turkey's Borders: Long-distance Kemalism, State Politics and the Turkish Diaspora* (I. B. Tauris, 2013). Her current research on Islamic art pedagogies in Istanbul engages with debates in anthropology about skilled learning, ethics, and Islamic cultural politics. She has a forthcoming monograph on this research project titled *Musical Ethics: Islam, Self-Making, and the Ney in Turkey*.

## **Amoral Sentiments in the Mediterranean: Familism, Civility and Civic Pride**

**Jon P. Mitchell, University of Sussex**

This paper examines the cluster of moral sentiments surrounding notions of civic pride, civil engagement, civility, and its opposites. Civility has recently become a subject of concern for political scientists and commentators, particularly in the USA, who lament its erosion in political and public discourse. Although ostensibly a debate about manners, the deeper roots of this concern with civility link it not merely to politeness or etiquette, but also deeper civic virtues. Lack of civility threatens the very possibility of society (Bejan 2017: 7). In the Italianate Mediterranean, civility – or *civiltá* – has signalled an aspirational (often literal) urbanity linked to elite forms of civil participation and civil engagement. This contrasts with more popular (and less civil) forms of civic pride, but also with the enduring *alter* to civility – as represented in various forms of familism, clientelism, *tengentismo*, and corruption that appear to work against the social, and against the public good. This paper examines the tensions between civility and its opposites in Naples since the Second World War, and in debates about corruption in Malta.

**Jon P. Mitchell** is Professor of Social Anthropology at the University of Sussex, UK. He has been researching Maltese culture and society since the early 1990s and written on diverse topics including the politics of nationalism and Europeanisation, clientelism and corruption, social memory, religious ritual and religious experience, and football. His publications include *Ambivalent Europeans* (Routledge, 2002), *Powers of Good and Evil* (Berghahn, 2002), *Global and Local Football* (Routledge, 2008) and *Ritual, Performance and the Senses* (Bloomsbury, 2015).

## **Is Honour a Moral Sentiment? Reframing the Debate on Honour in the Mediterranean**

**Jean Paul Baldacchino, University of Malta**

The 'honour-shame syndrome' has been considered as the 'locus classicus' of the anthropology of the Mediterranean. While the paradigm has long been challenged as a form of 'Mediterraneanism' (Herzfeld 1980, 1999), in this paper I argue that honour is a relevant moral principle in the Mediterranean. While the turn to the study of emotions in Anthropology has forced us to re-evaluate some of the classical binaries that have endured within anthropology, honour has never been considered as an emotion per se. Honour tends to be conceived of either as part of a 'code' in a pseudo-legalistic discourse, or rendered into a quasi-pathological symptom of a deficient 'moral reason'. Adopting a phenomenological approach, this paper will seek to re-evaluate honour as an intentional state. This paper will seek to test the proposition that honour could be considered as a 'moral sentiment' and therefore an essential component of moral structures.

**Jean Paul Baldacchino** is Head of Department and Senior Lecturer in Anthropology at the University of Malta. He is also currently the Director of the Mediterranean Institute at the University. He has published articles in a number of journals covering the anthropology of religion, popular culture and the anthropology of emotions. He has conducted fieldwork and published his research in the Mediterranean region and in South Korea.

## **Narrating the Humanitarian Border: Moral Deliberations of Territorial Border Workers on the EU's Mediterranean Border**

**Daniela DeBono, Malmö University**

The European Union's external border is the quintessential 'humanitarian border'. It is presented as a humanitarian and caring enterprise, while concealing its border control and exclusionary elements. Territorial border workers are the frontline fieldworkers tasked with implementing the laws and policies underpinning this humanitarian border, making them foremost actors in its construction. They present a defensive façade which may be interpreted as critical, but which actually merely oscillates within the humanitarian vs security debate, thus reproducing the basic tenets of the 'humanitarian border'. However, intertwined in the intricate fabric and form of these personal narratives is an emergent sense of discomfort with the dominant humanitarian-security framework. These elements suggest an ongoing search for a normative reference which is based on simple humanist ideas, human dignity and draws on their encounters and observations of these newcomers. In this rudimentary search for a 'normative humanism', I argue that we can detect a desire for a more 'humane border' rather than the current 'humanitarian border'. This article draws on multi-sited and long-term ethnographic work and is based on the personal narratives of territorial border workers located on the European Union's external border in Sicily, Italy.

**Daniela DeBono** is Senior Lecturer in the Department for Global Political Studies, Malmö University, Sweden, and a member of the Malmö Institute for the Studies of Migration, Diversity and Welfare (MIM). She is also Marie Skłodowska Curie COFAS Fellow at the European University Institute and Malmö University. She is a Research Affiliate with the Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta. Her background is in anthropology and human rights, and she received her PhD from the University of Sussex. Her publications focus on the migration-human rights nexus, with particular reference to irregular migration in Malta and southern Europe, first reception of irregular maritime migrants, deportation and citizenship. She is currently working on a multi-sited ethnographic project examining the everyday life of people working in the first reception systems on the EU's southern external borders.



## SEMINAR SERIES

### Entangled Histories of Emotions in the Mediterranean World

International Seminar Series  
contact: [giovanni.tarantino@uwa.edu.au](mailto:giovanni.tarantino@uwa.edu.au)

FLORENCE, ITALY, 5 February 2018

European University Institute

*Mediterranean Encounters: People in Motion*

This workshop will examine people on the move and contacts between different cultures in the Mediterranean world. On the one hand, travel accounts provide a rich source for exploring the emotions involved in intercultural encounters, but the contacts of various types of travellers (diplomats, merchants, as well as others travelling professionally or forced into exile) can also be explored through their private correspondence. The trajectories of individuals who changed both culture and religion, whether by force or choice, can also be fruitfully explored through the prism of emotions. The emotions involved in intercultural encounters are more varied than is often assumed in studies of 'Orientalism', and can thus help to shed new light on Mediterranean history. This workshop will provide an opportunity to reflect on how studying the great variety of Mediterranean encounters through the lens of emotions can enrich our understanding of them.

BRISBANE, AUSTRALIA, 5 May 2018

The University of Queensland

*Entangled Histories of Gender in the Medieval Mediterranean World*

This workshop will focus on gender as a product and driver of interactions in the medieval Mediterranean, especially France, Spain, Italy, north Africa and the Holy Land. Through a number of case studies, the workshop asks how gender and emotion both inform and are reflected in historical relationships between people, places and things. It will also broadly interrogate whether the well-worn idea of gender as a category of analysis can still serve as a fruitful framework/paradigm for the transcultural, multivalent and deeply relational histories – or entangled histories – of the medieval Mediterranean.

BUDAPEST, HUNGARY, 18 June 2018

Central European University, Institute for Advanced Study

*Religious Sentiments Across Central and Eastern Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean*

This workshop will look specifically at the relations between religion, religious sentiments and emotions across Central and Eastern Europe, Southeastern Europe and the Eastern Arab Mediterranean. The workshop will integrate two perspectives in terms of contact zones, by relating cross-imperial boundaries, contacts and transfers as well as religious boundaries within given multi-confessional societies. The central question will be what role religion played in shaping emotions and repertoires of emotion and perceptions thereof, including how to make sense of irrational emotions. How are similarities and differences of regimes of body language and emotional registers and economy explained in religious terms? How are religious traditions and formation in multi-confessional contexts inscribed in non-religious practices? When do such perceptions change and how do we as historians measure such change? To this end, the workshop will address issues of methodology and historical case studies, in which Islam will play a special, though not exclusive role. Methodologically, the focus will be on the tangibility or otherwise of religious sentiments in given materials and practices (Muslim, Jewish, Orthodox, Catholic, and rejections thereof). As for empirical studies, the workshop will focus on case studies involving the complex relationship of body, religious practice and emotion, including sentiments disavowing the impact of religion on the economy of emotion and religious sentiments.

MSIDA, MALTA, 11 February 2019

The Mediterranean Institute, University of Malta

*Moral Sentiments in the Mediterranean: Social, Historical and Cultural Perspectives*

This workshop will look specifically at the relationship between emotions and moral structures in the Mediterranean region. It starts from the premise that 'emotions may actually be essential and enduring features of our moral character' (Oatley 1999: 5). The workshop will integrate two different perspectives. It will look at the role that emotions have played in the construction of 'moral reason' in the Mediterranean. What is the relationship between morality, emotions and rationality in the different societies of the region? When are sentiments valid grounds for moral action? The workshop will also look at specific emotions whose proper object could be identified as 'moral' (pride, shame, guilt, compassion and humility, for example). Are there regional similarities in the ways in which such emotions are understood and the actions they impel? Do the local semantic inflections of such moral sentiments underscore a different understanding of morality and/or the emotions? Were there significant historical shifts in the ways in which such emotions are articulated within the economic, political and social currents in the region? How are moral sentiments engendered in the Mediterranean? Recognising that such emotions, if not socially constructed are at least socially articulated, contributors to this workshop will look at varieties of moral sentiments in the Mediterranean and its narratives. Contributors can focus on individual emotions (past and present), look at the deployment of emotions or conduct a comparative study of one or more emotions within a society or across different societies across the Mediterranean basin.



The series is a joint initiative by the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions (CHE), the Society for the History of Emotions (SHE), The Mediterranean Institute at the University of Malta, the Italian National Research Council (CNR/ISPF), the Chair of Intellectual History at the European University Institute (EUI), the Institute for Advanced Study at Central European University (IAS-CEU), the Italian National Institute for Higher Mathematics (INdAM), the Centre for the Study of Emotions in Cross-Cultural Exchange (ECCE, Zagreb), the Network for Global History (GLOBHIS, Florence) and the School of Historical and Philosophical Inquiry at The University of Queensland. For details of previous seminars and the work of the 'Entangled Histories in the Mediterranean World' research cluster, go to: <http://ow.ly/QzrR30lTupG>

*Image: Convenors of the 'Entangled Histories of Emotions in the Mediterranean World' series meet at the CEU Institute for Advanced Study in Budapest, Hungary, 18 June 2018. From left to right (standing): Randi Deguilhem, Nadia Al-Bagdadi, Nina Peršak, Giovanni Tarantino, Mirko Sardelić, Tolga U. Esmer, Vedran Nikolić, Olivia Michalowska, Graziano Gentili; (seated): Lisa Beaven, Ann Thomson, Luisa Simonutti. Courtesy of Ivan Missoni.*