



SEMINAR SERIES

Entangled Histories of Emotions in the Mediterranean World



INSTITUTE FORANCED ADVSTUDY
CENTRAL EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY



SOCIETY FOR THE HISTORY OF EMOTIONS

Emotions and Religious Sentiments across Central and Eastern Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean



Image: Vittore Carpaccio, *Sermon of St. Stephen at Jerusalem*, c.1514. © Musée du Louvre/A. Dequier - M. Bard.

DATE: 18 June 2018

VENUE: IAS, Central European University (CEU), Budapest, Nador 15, Room 101 (Quantum)

TIME: 9am-5pm

CONVENORS: Nadia Al-Bagdadi and Giovanni Tarantino in cooperation with Tolga U. Esmer

FREE EVENT but RSVP requested by Monday 11 June for catering purposes

CONTACT: Andrey Demidov
(DemidovA@ceu.edu)

This workshop will look at the relations between religion, religious sentiments and emotions across Central and Eastern Europe, Southeastern Europe and the Eastern Arab Mediterranean. The workshop will integrate two perspectives in terms of contact zones, by relating cross-imperial boundaries, contacts and transfers as well as religious boundaries within given multi-confessional societies. The central question will be what role religion played in shaping emotions and repertoires of emotion and perceptions thereof, including how to make sense of irrational emotions. How are similarities and differences of regimes of body language and emotional registers and economy explained in religious terms? How are religious traditions and formations in multi-confessional contexts inscribed in non-religious practices? When do such perceptions change and how do we as historians measure such change? To this end, the workshop will address issues of methodology and historical case studies, in which Islam will play a special, though not exclusive role. Methodologically, the focus will be on the tangibility of religious sentiments in given materials and practices (Muslim, Jewish, Orthodox, Catholic, and rejections thereof). As for empirical studies, the workshop will focus on case studies involving the complex relationship of body, religious practice and emotion, including sentiments disavowing the impact of religion on the economy of emotion and religious sentiments.



Australian Government
Australian Research Council



18 JUNE 2018

INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY, CENTRAL EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY (CEU), BUDAPEST, HUNGARY

9:00	Arrival, coffee
	Welcome and opening remarks: Nadia Al-Bagdadi (IAS CEU), Tolga U. Esmer (CEMS CEU), Giovanni Tarantino (CHE-UWA/CNR-ISPF)
Panel 1 Chair: Luisa Simonutti (CNR-ISPF, Milan)	
9:10	Sona Grigoryan (CEU): 'Understanding Attitudes Towards Religion Through Poetics of Ambivalence: The Case of al-Ma'arri's <i>Lužum</i> ' Lisa Beaven (La Trobe University, Melbourne): 'Praying the Rosary: Ritual, Religious Emotion and Rosary Confraternities in the Early Modern Mediterranean'
10:40–11:00	Coffee and Tea Break
Panel 2 Chair: Mirko Sardelic (ECCE, Zagreb & UWA)	
11:00–12:30	Ádám Mézes (CEU): 'Fear, Superstition and Contagion in the 1732 Learned Debate on Vampires' Tolga U. Esmer (CEMS CEU): 'Economies of Affect and Imperial (Un)Common Sense in the Archives during the Ottoman "Age of Revolution", c.1801'
12:30–14:00	Lunch
Panel 3 Chair: Didem Unal Abaday (IAS CEU)	
14:00–15:30	Randi Deguilhem (Aix-Marseille University): 'Unspoken Emotions in Waqfiyya Foundational Documents: An Example from Ottoman Damascus' Nina Peršak (IAS CEU): 'Minority Religion and Majority Fear: Visibility, Space, Emotions and the Law'
15:30–16:00	Coffee and Tea Break
Roundtable Chair: Giovanni Tarantino (CHE-UWA/CNR-ISPF)	
16:00–17:00	Nadia Al-Bagdadi (IAS CEU), Tolga U. Esmer (CEMS CEU) and Ann Thomson (EUI, Florence)

ABSTRACTS

Praying the Rosary: Ritual, Religious Emotion and Rosary Confraternities in the Early Modern Mediterranean

LISA BEAVEN

(La Trobe University)

The role of the material in generating religious identities and emotional communities throughout Europe and the Mediterranean has long been understood. It is only more recently, however, that the role of the rosary and rosary confraternities have been considered specifically in relation to the battle of Lepanto and the conflict with the Ottoman Empire. This paper will consider the ritual of praying the rosary and the growth of rosary confraternities in the light of its mobilisation against the Ottoman Empire in the seventeenth century. It argues that, after the battle of Lepanto, praying the rosary became more than a ritual associated with spiritual faith and internal emotional states; it was re-framed as an action taken against an external threat.

LISA BEAVEN teaches art history and history at La Trobe University in Melbourne. Her scholarship centres on early modern Italian art and religion, patronage and collecting in Rome, and on the emotional responses to art in the counter-reformation period. Her recent interests include landscape painting and ecology, digital mapping, and early modern material culture. Her book, *An Ardent Patron: Cardinal Camillo Massimo and his Artistic and Antiquarian Circle: Claude Lorrain, Nicolas Poussin and Diego Velazquez*, was published in 2010 (P. Holberton, and Centro de Estudios Europa Hispánica), and her co-edited book (with Angela Ndaliansi), *Emotion and the Seduction of the Senses, Baroque to Neo-Baroque*, was published by MIP Press in 2018.

Unspoken Emotions in Waqfiyya Foundational Documents: An Example from Ottoman Damascus

RANDI DEGUILHEM

(Aix-Marseille University)

Within the context of studying entangled histories of emotions in the Mediterranean world, this presentation focuses on unspoken emotions which are nonetheless present in the waqf foundation charters, the *waqfiyyas*, and which embody influential and determinative roles. These emotions, although not specifically mentioned as such within the documents, are nevertheless of a performative nature which becomes visible, particularly when examining the relationship between the endower of the foundation and the beneficiaries of the foundation's revenues. This is likewise the case when analysing the relationship between the endower and the administrator(s) who are also nominatively designated by the endower and who are responsible for the management of the foundation's real estate or other assets. This configuration between endower, beneficiaries and administrator directly reflects and depends upon the personal history of the endower's emotions, which are embedded within societal configurations.

The waqf foundation charter, although highly codified in terms of legal structure and religious jurisprudential regulations in accordance with the specific *madhhab* with which the document is registered, is thereby infused with the history of emotions with respect to the personal trajectory of the endower, woman or man. Notwithstanding the systemised and formulaic nature of the document itself, emotions are, indeed, the vital and central component of the network that is put into place by the creation of the foundation, the details of which are designated by the endower and inscribed within the charter.

As will be analysed during this talk through the example of a foundation created in nineteenth-century Damascus by a woman whose beneficiaries include her husband's nephews, the endower's emotions shape the nature of the foundation. This reflects aspects of her or his personal network, institutionalised within this self-contained structure and regulated by religious and legal jurisprudence.

Religion therefore plays a role in institutionalising and recognising the emotions contained within the structure of the waqf foundation. Important in this regard are the theoretical and jurisprudential books of the 'regulations of waqf' and the *ahkâm al-awqâf*, as well as *fatwâs* and decisions made by the religious tribunal personnel who produced judgements or ratified them with respect to the operations of the foundations and the relationships between the endower and the concerned individuals.

RANDI DEGUILHEM is a Professor (directrice de recherche habilitée) with the Centre national de la recherche scientifique (CNRS) and Temps, Espaces, Langages, Europe Méridionale – Méditerranée (TELEMMe-MMSH) at Aix-Marseille University. She is a historian of the modern and contemporary Arab and Muslim world, specialising in nineteenth- to twenty-first-century Syria. Her research interests include the law and practices of waqf, part of which focuses on women, as well as Ottoman public education and secularising institutions in late Ottoman and Mandate Syria. As a Fulbright-Hays doctoral research recipient and then a research fellow at the French Institute for Arab Studies in Damascus (IFEAD), she lived in Syria for several years. She has recently conducted field research on Islam on the French island of Reunion, in which she adopts a comparative approach with her research on the Middle East. She has published and co-edited 10 books and about 50 book chapters and articles, and has organised several international research programs including the CNRS International Research Network (GDRI) on waqf (2012–2016). From 2010 to 2016, she directed a seminar at the Institut d'Etude de l'Islam et de Sociétés du Monde Musulman (IISMM-EHESS), Paris, on waqf trust endowments.

Economies of Affect and Imperial (un)Common Sense in the Archives During the Ottoman 'Age of Revolution', c.1801

TOLGA U. ESMER

(Central European University)

By appointing Mehmet Hakkı Paşa for the second time as the governor of Rumeli in April 1801, Sultan Selim III and his confidants sincerely hoped that they would find in him an uncompromising, resolute official who could stamp out a bandit insurgency that had spread from the Danubian borderlands throughout Rumeli for close to a decade. During his first tenure as governor in 1796, Hakkı Paşa had acquired a controversial reputation for his brutality in tracking down and slaughtering not only important bandit leaders, but also local *a'yân* and other officials imbricated in the bandit networks' large, lucrative web of crime. But no one imagined that the war against bandit terror would drag on for so long, so five years later the sultan reappointed the draconian paşa hoping that he could reassert central control over the region. Nevertheless, Hakkı Paşa's second posting as governor again went awry very quickly; this time, however, not so much because of the controversial things he did but rather for the things he wrote and said. What fueled the animosity that quickly mounted against Hakkı Paşa in Istanbul this time was that he focused more on Ottoman 'white turban' crime, namely high-ranking imperial officials' clandestinely supporting, or openly collaborating with, notorious bandit enterprises. His overzealousness to serve the faith and state manifested itself

in his lack of restraint in writing vituperative letters to and about some of the empire's highest-ranking officials entangled in bandit racketeering enterprises. His creative flair for offending those he perceived to be corrupt or obstacles in his path drew too much attention to himself. Upon his correspondence circulating among the top echelons of the empire, numerous comments scribbled anxiously by the sultan and his ministers in the margins attest to how Hakkı Paşa's penchant for speaking his mind without restraint had immediate, deleterious repercussions for his career.

This paper borrows the concept of 'economies of affect' from anthropology to talk about specific types of conduct and performances through which imperial governance is realised and forms subjects. It does so in order to shed light on the relationship between sentiment and antipathy among imperial officials and poor imperial decision-making. It focuses on the imperial sensibilities and sentiments that informed adverse reactions to, and vengeful plots against, Hakkı Paşa's whistle-blowing against elite corruption as he understood it. Hakkı Paşa's overzealousness in erecting boundaries between licit and illicit behaviour when it came to collusion with bandit enterprises and the use of authorised force among his peers and superiors meant that he probed too far into their interactions with vast criminal networks. But more importantly, the callous, insulting ways in which he wrote about high-ranking Ottoman officials threatened to undermine the social distinctions that bolstered the very foundations of what it meant to be a respected member of the Ottoman elite order. These social sensibilities proved much more important to Istanbul elites than stomping out one of the most brutal insurgencies in the empire's history, which forever changed the central government's hold on its realm.

TOLGA U. ESMER works on the imbrications of crime, corruption and imperial governance and their broader implications for inter- and intra-confessional relations and nation-state formation in the Ottoman world and its successor states. He has recently published a number of articles in journals such as *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, *Past & Present*, *The Journal of Ottoman Studies* and *the European Journal of Turkish Studies*. He is currently completing a book titled *The Bandit Files: Economies of Violence and Affect in Late Ottoman Political Culture*.

Understanding Attitudes Towards Religion Through Poetics of Ambivalence: The Case of al-Ma'arrī's *Luzūm*

SONA GRIGORYAN

(Central European University)

This paper will demonstrate how, in an environment of intellectual diversity, competing religious orthodoxies, alternating political power and epistemological plurality, ambivalence might become a dominant emotional experience while dealing with matters of religion. Ambivalence, i.e., co-existence in one person or in one work of contradictory emotions or attitudes towards the same object or the same situation, is seen in this presentation as a hermeneutical tool for interpreting attitudes towards religion and tenets of religion. As a case study, the paper will rely on a collection of poems by the eleventh-century Syrian blind poet and prose-writer, Abū'l-'Alā' al-Ma'arrī (d.1051), titled *Luzūm mā lā yalzam* (The Necessity of what is not Necessary). *Luzūm* is famous for its inconsistencies in content, especially on matters of religion, which was seen by many as a means of concealing or dissimulating religiously dangerous ideas rather than an expression of anxiety, doubt and genuine ambivalence. The paper will suggest that al-Ma'arrī's *Luzūm*, being directly informed by the heated intellectual and religious debates of the day, is an

expression of epistemological anxiety prevailing in the religious and intellectual life of tenth- and eleventh-century Syria and Iraq. The paper will specifically discuss notions of God and prophecy in *Luzūm* and the contradictory emotions the author exposed towards them through a poetic medium.

SONA GRIGORYAN completed her PhD in Medieval Studies at the Central European University. Her doctoral research explored notions of unbelief and freethinking in the writings of the eleventh-century Syrian poet, Abu'l-'Ala' al-Ma'arri (d.1058). Her first MA study at the Yerevan State University dealt with modern Sunni fundamentalist thought, and her second MA at CEU explored the anti-Christian polemics of the famous Muslim thinker, Ibn Taymiyya (d.1328). Her future research will explore anti-Christian polemical trends in the Ottoman Empire within the scope of an ERC project ('Ottoconfession') at CEU.

Fear, Superstition and Contagion in the 1732 Learned Debate on Vampires

ÁDÁM MÉZES

(Central European University)

In the winter of 1731, an apparent vampire epidemic struck the small military settlement of Medvedia in Habsburg Serbia. Dozens died over a short period of time and medical reports of the case incited a heated debate at the universities and in the learned Protestant circles of Leipzig, Halle and Jena. Most of the participants in the debate explained the phenomenon as a natural endemic or epidemic disease, at the same time construing the villagers as members of a community of fear. The Orthodox clergy was blamed for planting ignorance, superstition and fear of the returning dead into the hearts of people, who passed these burdens on to their children. This narrative of othering was based on the idea that the Serbian villagers were bound together by ties of religion, morality and emotions, but whether the bonds were strong enough to channel sickness and death was contentious. Could these ties aggravate diseases, or be fatal or contagious in themselves, and could they act from beyond the grave? Was Orthodox superstition and fear specific, or was it comparable to Catholic or Protestant sentiments of the same kind? Tracing these issues in the learned vampire treatises, I will situate the debate on the physiology of superstitious fear in the wider context of the early German enlightenment, and in this way try to bring together the histories of emotions, medicine and religion.

ÁDÁM MÉZES holds MA degrees in History and English Studies from Eötvös Loránd University (ELTE Budapest), and an MA in Comparative History from the Central European University (CEU). He is working on his doctoral project, titled 'Doubt and Diagnosis: Medical Experts Facing the Supernatural on the Southern Habsburg Borderland' at CEU. He has been a visiting student at Cornell University and the University of Cambridge and has taught courses at ELTE Budapest. His main research interests are science and technology studies, religious studies and cultural history, with a special focus on the eighteenth-century Habsburg Empire.

EMOTIONS
MAKE
HISTORY

Minority Religion and Majority Fear: Visibility, Space, Emotions and the Law

NINA PERŠAK

(Central European University)

Various recent 'crises' in the EU have revealed a certain dark side of European democracies, including the uncomfortable ease with which some governments and their citizens resort to othering, and scapegoating the other, as a result of discomfort in their own lives. In part, this societal reaction may be due to fears about crime, triggered by recent terrorist attacks, which feed into people's feelings of insecurity, precariousness and life volatility. Apart from 'real' fear, however, a significant part of today's societal reaction towards certain groups, e.g., Muslims and 'migrants', is based on irrational emotions, stirred by media and populist politicians pursuing their own illiberal agendas. In an environment of heightened fear, populist governments tend to thrive, especially those with programs that strategically rely on callous fear-mongering, persistent rhetoric of threat and crude separation between 'us' and 'them'. My paper will illustrate this using a few recent social and legal reactions to the (sartorial and gestural) manifestations of faith, which continue to stir emotions in Europe, motivating calls for prohibition or some other restriction of liberties – issues which are in the European context often ultimately resolved by laws and courts. I will inspect the interaction between the rationale or logic of 'visibility' in the public space, minority claims to public space and the question of their 'place' in the majority culture. Next, I will examine the critical role of law in these debates. I will argue for the need to deconstruct legal discourse on these matters and against limitations of freedom that are based on irrational emotions.

NINA PERŠAK holds a doctorate in law from University of Ljubljana, and an LLM (Master of Law) and MPhil in social and developmental psychology from the University of Cambridge. She is Scientific Director of the Institute for Criminal-Law Ethics and Criminology in Ljubljana, a law professor, habilitated by the University of Maribor, and a senior fellow of the Institute of Advanced Study at the Central European University. She has previously worked as a research professor in the Faculty of Law at Ghent University, and has held research and professorial posts in Ljubljana and visiting scholarships at the universities of Cambridge and Helsinki, Sofia University and the University of California, Berkeley.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This international seminar series is a joint initiative of the Society for the History of Emotions, the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, Europe 1100-1800 (CHE), the Italian National Research Council Institute for the History of Philosophical and Scientific Thought in the Modern Age (CNR-ISPF), the Chair of Intellectual History at the European University Institute (EUI), the Institute for Advanced Study at Central European University (IAS-CEU), the Croatian Centre for the Study of Emotions in Cross-Cultural Exchange (ECCE), the School of Humanities at The University of Queensland, and the Italian National Institute for Higher Mathematics (INdAM).